



# HIGHWAYS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

10 December 2013

# REPORT

**Subject Heading:**

**BUS STOP ACCESSIBILITY  
ARDLEIGH GREEN ROAD,  
BUTTS GREEN ROAD,  
BILLET LANE & NORTH STREET  
Outcome of public consultation**

**Report Author and contact details:**

Mark Philpotts  
Principal Engineer  
01708 433751  
mark.philpotts@havering.gov.uk

**The subject matter of this report deals with the following Council Objectives**

Clean, safe and green borough	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Excellence in education and learning	<input type="checkbox"/>
Opportunities for all through economic, social and cultural activity	<input type="checkbox"/>
Value and enhance the life of every individual	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
High customer satisfaction and a stable council tax	<input type="checkbox"/>

**SUMMARY**

This report sets out the responses to a consultation for the provision of fully accessible bus stops along Ardleigh Green Road, Butts Green Road, Billet Lane and North Street and seeks a recommendation that the proposals be implemented as set out in the report.

The scheme is within **Squirrels Heath, Emerson Park** and **St Andrews** wards.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the Committee having considered the representations made recommends to the Cabinet Member for Community Empowerment that the bus stop accessibility improvements set out in this report and shown on the following drawings are implemented;
  - QM016-OF-201A
  - QM016-OF-203A
  - QM016-OF-204A
  - QM016-OF-205A (southbound stop only)
  - QM016-OF-206A
  - QM016-OF-207A
  - QM016-OF-208A
  - QM016-OF-209A
  - QM016-OF-210A
  - QM016-OF-211A
  - QM016-OF-213A
  
2. That the Committee having considered the representations made recommends to the Cabinet Member for Community Empowerment that one of the following bus stop accessibility options as set out in this report and shown on the following drawings are implemented;
  - (i) QM016-OF-212A; or
  - (ii) QM016-OF-212-2A
  
3. That it be noted that an alternative to the proposals shown on Drawing QM016-OF-205A (northbound stop only) is being consulted on and will be the subject of an additional committee report in early 2014.
  
4. That it be noted that the estimated cost of £35,000 for implementation will be met by Transport for London through the 2013/14 Local Implementation Plan allocation for Bus Stop Accessibility.

## REPORT DETAIL

### 1.0 Background

- 1.1 People with mobility problems, the elderly and people travelling with young children find it difficult to board or alight from buses, unless the vehicle is able to pull in close to the kerb (within 200mm). The difficulty of gaining kerbside access is often caused by indiscriminately parked vehicles, or lack of high kerb space adjacent to stops.
- 1.2 Improvements to the bus stop environment such as raising kerbs, relaying footway surfaces, providing short footway links to stops and (in exceptional circumstances) providing pedestrian crossing facilities can help with making bus stops fully accessible to all people. In some situations, it may be appropriate to build the footway out into the road to provide an accessible bus stop, although this will only be appropriate where carriageways are very wide.
- 1.3 The introduction of bus stop clearways improves the accessibility of bus stops by providing sufficient space for buses to pull in close to the kerb. It has become even more important with the provision of buses that are fully wheelchair accessible, because the benefits of low-floor and “kneeling” buses are considerably reduced (if not removed) if the bus cannot be positioned next to the kerb.
- 1.4 Drawing QB109/00/01B shows a standard bus stop layout where the bus stop is within a length of parked vehicles. In such a situation, a 37 metre long bus stop clearway is required to enable buses to meet the kerb so that both loading doors can be used. Where local conditions allow, this length can be reduced and so any design work will consider needs on a case by case basis.
- 1.5 In some situations, it is recognised that buses stopping on the carriageway can have an impact on traffic flows, especially on narrow roads. However, bus stops which are fully accessible to all people allow for buses to use stops more efficiently, minimising the length of time a bus is stationary. This will have the positive effect of reducing disruption to traffic flows to a minimum.
- 1.6 Where buses cannot fully access the kerb, then there may be delays in the loading or unloading of passengers leading to buses stopping longer than necessary. In some cases, certain passengers may not be able to access buses at all or the bus driver will simply need to pass the stop by where access to the kerb is not possible.
- 1.7 There are 690 bus stops in Havering. 663 are on borough roads, 20 are on the Transport for London Road Network and 7 are in private areas (e.g. Queen’s Hospital). Data as of November 2013.

- 1.8 Of these stops, 47% are deemed to be fully accessible. In order for a stop to be fully accessible, it must meet the following criteria;
- The kerb to the footway must be between 125mm and 140mm to be compatible with the front and rear loading doors of the bus and the ramp deployed from the rear loading doors;
  - The bus stop should be restricted from parking and stopping by a bus stop clearway so that the stop is always available for buses to be able to pull into tightly to the kerb.
- 1.9 For Havering, funding for Bus Stop Accessibility works has mainly come from the Transport for London Local Implementation plan (LIP), but occasionally funding is secured as part of the development process.
- 1.10 Staff from StreetCare work with TfL London Buses and the Police (where required) on a programme of mainly route-based Bus Stop Accessibility improvements, although individual sites are investigated from time to time where there are particular problems.
- 1.11 The route approach allows for comprehensive review of existing bus stop positions for accessibility, convenience, safety etc. and sometimes requires stops to be moved away from points of conflict such as where parking or proliferation of vehicle crossings prevent stops being accessible in their existing positions.
- 1.12 Proposals for accessibility improvements have been developed for various existing bus stops along Ardleigh Green Road, Butts Green Road, Billet Lane and North Street as set out in the following tables;

<b>ARDLEIGH GREEN ROAD</b>		
<b>Drawing Reference</b>	<b>Location</b>	<b>Description of proposals</b>
QM016-OF201A	Outside 225 to 229	Bus stop flag relocated to common boundary of nos. 227 & 229.  21 metre bus stop clearway.  140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.
QM016-OF-203A	Outside 159 to 165	23 metre bus stop clearway.  140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.  <i>Note: Space would be left should 157</i>

		<i>to 163 request formal vehicle crossing in the future.</i>
QM016-OF-204A	Outside Havering College	Bus shelter moved 3.5 metres south. 25 metre bus stop clearway. 140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.
QM016-OF-205A	Outside 75 to 83	37 metre bus stop clearway.
QM016-OF-205A	South of Ayloff's Walk	33 metre bus stop clearway.
QM016-OF-206A	Outside 23 to 27	29 metre bus stop clearway.
QM016-OF-207A	South of Woodlands Avenue	27 metre bus stop clearway.

**BUTTS GREEN ROAD**

<b>Drawing Reference</b>	<b>Location</b>	<b>Description of proposals</b>
QM016-OF-208A	Outside Greenways Court	37 metre bus stop clearway
QM016-OF-209A	Outside Thorpe Lodge	Shelter turned round and placed at rear of footway.  37 metre bus stop clearway.  140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.

**BILLET LANE**

<b>Drawing Reference</b>	<b>Location</b>	<b>Description of proposals</b>
QM016-OF-210A	Outside Emerson Park Court / 153	25 metre bus stop clearway.  140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.

<b>NORTH STREET</b>		
<b>Drawing Reference</b>	<b>Location</b>	<b>Description of proposals</b>
QM016-OF-211A	Outside 96 to 108	Existing lay-by made a bus stop clearway.  140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.
QM016-OF-212A <b>(Option 1, existing location)</b>	Outside 87 to 89	23 metre bus stop clearway.  140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.
QM016-OF-212-2A <b>(Option 2, alternative location)</b>	To be relocated outside Menthone Place	Bus stop to be relocated 35m south outside Menthone Place  27 metre bus stop clearway  140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.
QM016-OF-213A	Outside Crown House	37 metre bus stop clearway.  140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.
QM016-OF-213A	Outside Sainsbury Car Park	31 metre bus stop clearway.  140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.

1.13 Approximately 135 letters were hand-delivered to those potentially affected by the scheme on or just after 25<sup>th</sup> October 2013, with a closing date of 18<sup>th</sup> November 2013 for comments.

1.14 In addition, ward councillors, Highways Advisory Committee members and standard consultees (London Buses, emergency services, interest groups etc) were sent a set of the consultation information.

## **2.0 Outcome of Public Consultation**

2.1 By the close of consultation, 10 responses were received which are summarised in Appendix I.

- 2.2 With regard to the proposed bus stop clearway at 75 to 83 Ardleigh Green Road, the northbound stop shown on Drawing QM016-OF-205A, a proposal to relocate the bus stop to another location is under consultation. A separate report will be presented early in 2014.
- 2.2 With regard to the two options at 87 to 89 North Street (Drawing QM016-OF-212A) and outside Menthone Place, North Street (Drawing QM016-OF-212-2A), there was support and opposition for the relocate position.

### **3.0 Staff Comments**

- 3.1 With regard to the options at 87 to 89 North Street (Drawing QM016-OF-212A) and outside Menthone Place, North Street (Drawing QM016-OF-212-2A), there are competing views.
- 3.2 The police prefer the stop to be moved because of reduced conflict with vehicles accessing the business premises at No.87. This relocation is also supported by the resident at No.89 who is affected by the current location.
- 3.3 However, there is objection from a resident and the managing agent of Menthone Place in terms of impact on the residents of Menthone Place, plus a resident immediately opposite the alternative location objects. A further resident opposite the alternative location suggests a completely different location.
- 3.4 The existing location can be made accessible. The alternative location can be made accessible and would provide space for a shelter. Staff suggest that members consider the comments made and make a recommendation accordingly.
- 3.5 The other locations have not received any comments and Staff recommend that they be implemented as consulted.

## **IMPLICATIONS AND RISKS**

### **Financial implications and risks:**

The estimated cost of £35,000 for implementation will be met by Transport for London through the 2013/14 Local Implementation Plan allocation for Bus Stop Accessibility. The funding will need to be spent by 31st March 2014, to ensure full access to the grant.

The costs shown are an estimate of the full costs of the scheme, should it be implemented. It should be noted that subject to the recommendations of the



committee a final decision then would be made by the Lead Member – as regards actual implementation and scheme detail. Therefore, final costs are subject to change.

This is a standard project for StreetCare and there is no expectation that the works cannot be contained within the cost estimate. There is an element of contingency built into the financial estimate. In the unlikely event of an overspend, the balance would need to be contained within the overall StreetCare Capital budget.

**Legal implications and risks:**

Bus Stop Clearways do not require traffic orders, but Department for Transport guidance suggests that local consultations should take place.

**Human Resources implications and risks:**

None.

**Equalities Implications and Risks:**

The Council has a general duty under the Equality Act 2010 to ensure that its highway network is accessible to all users. Where infrastructure is provided or substantially upgraded, reasonable adjustments should be made to improve access. In considering the impacts and making improvements for people with protected characteristics (mainly, but not limited to disabled people, the young and older people), this will assist the Council in meeting its duty under the Act.

The provision of fully accessible bus stops assists with making public transport more inclusive to all sectors of the community, but most especially disabled people and people using pushchairs. Accessible bus stops will be of benefit to people using wheelchairs, but also people who have walking, balance and dexterity difficulties; and blind and partially-sighted people.

**BACKGROUND PAPERS**

Project file: QM016, Bus Stop Accessibility 2013/14

**APPENDIX I  
CONSULTATION RESPONSES**

<b>Respondent</b>	<b>Drawing Reference &amp; Location</b>	<b>Summary of Comments</b>	<b>Staff Comments</b>
Cllr Roger Ramsey	General	Seeking confirmation that no kerb build-outs are proposed.	Staff confirmed that no kerb build-outs are proposed.
Alan Ford London Buses Operations	General	Fully supports programme from an operational point of view.	None.
Martin Young Metropolitan Police Chadwell Heath Traffic Garage	General	No issues with the plans as presented.	None.
	QM016-OF-212- OPTION 2A  (Option 2, alternative location). To be relocated outside Menthone Place	Looks to be the better option, with less conflict with the vehicles using the business premises at number 87. Plus it will allow the provision of a shelter.	Will need to be considered by the committee with other, competing views.
Mr & Mrs Randall 89 North Street	QM016-OF-212- OPTION 2A  (Option 2, alternative location). To be relocated outside Menthone Place	Plan to move bus stop outside Mentone Place seems to be the best idea. The kerb at the bus stop outside our house already encroaches over our driveway by about 2ft. This makes reversing out of our driveway quite hazardous, especially in the morning, when the bus stop and main road are at their most busy.  As stated on your plan, relocating the bus stop to Mentone Place would give a larger accessibility area and allow a bus shelter which would create a boundary	Will need to be considered by the committee with other, competing views.

		<p>between the flats and the bus passengers.</p> <p>The Garden centre situation at No.87 have agreed that this would be the best solution as they and the other businesses on the site constantly use their frontage for deliveries and customer parking. Once again the bus stop at its present location cause difficulties.</p> <p>Also having the bus stop in such close proximity to our property, over the years we have had to deal with some unpleasantness with people using the bus stop. Therefore the proposed solution would be favourable for all concerned.</p>	
<p>Darren Stoner J. Nicholson &amp; Son</p>	<p>QM016-OF-212- OPTION 2A</p> <p>(Option 2, alternative location). To be relocated outside Menthone Place</p>	<p>We write as the Managing Agents of the above block of flats. We have been made aware by the leaseholders that there is a proposal for a raised kerb and a bus shelter to be installed outside Menthone Place.</p> <p>We are responsible for the maintenance of the external communal parts and we are concerned that access will be prevented/ hindered to our communal bin area for collections. We also raise concerns about the possible increase in litter around the property as a result of the shelters placement.</p> <p>Given the placement of the shelter it will be an intrusion of the residents' privacy as it is situation directly in front of the properties private residence. We would like to point out that where the bus stop is currently, it is outside a commercial property, which may be of benefit to them,</p>	<p>Will need to be considered by the committee with other, competing views.</p>

		<p>however this also raises concerns about excessive noise with people waiting around outside a residential building.</p> <p>Finally we would like to raise concerns of Highway Safety, as where the planned bus shelter is proposed, it will obstruct the vision of anyone exiting Menthone Place to oncoming traffic. It would also be dangerous if a bus has stopped there and a vehicle is exiting, they will not see oncoming vehicles or motorcycles potentially overtaking the bus.</p> <p>We would be grateful to receive your written comments in respect of our concerns at your earliest convenience and if there is any reason why the change is to be made now as we were unaware of any previous problems.</p>	
<p>Russell Soar 78 North Street</p>	<p>QM016-OF-212- OPTION 2A</p> <p>(Option 2, alternative location). To be relocated outside Menthone Place</p>	<p>I am slightly confused by the diagram showing changes to the existing bus stop outside 87 North Street, then a second diagram showing it relocated outside Mentone Place.</p> <p>Is it your intension to carry our works on both sites?</p> <p>This would appear to be unnecessary and expensive.</p> <p>I would suggest that as you are considering moving this bus stop, 35m closer to the Sainsburys car park bus stop, you consider moving it to the mid point between them.</p> <p>The initial benefit would be that the works would only be needed on one site rather than potentially 3 times.</p>	<p>Will need to be considered by the committee with other, competing views.</p> <p>TfL not considering removing both stops to replace with one mid-way as it would reduce area served by route in terms of access for passenger catchment.</p>

		<p>Subsidiary benefits would be moving the bus stop closer to the Queens theatre, the library and the Fairkytes complex.</p> <p>I am aware from previous correspondence that easy access between the Library and Langtons Gardens is considered to be of vital importance.</p> <p>Additionally, another benefit would be to allow cars exiting to Sainsburys car park, a clear view as it can be blocked when there is a bus at this stop.</p> <p>I realise that this proposal would have to be agreed with TfL and possibly the bus operators but feel that it could be a considerable cost saving in these times of austerity.</p>	
Roy Pollard 4 Menthone Place	<p>QM016-OF-212- OPTION 2A</p> <p>(Option 2, alternative location). To be relocated outside Menthone Place</p>	<p>With regard to the above mentioned references and your proposal to possibly relocate the bus stop to outside Menthone Place, I give below my comments and objections to this proposal.</p> <p>Historically, given this bus stop currently located outside 87 North Street has been there for 40 or more years without any problems to drivers or passengers and that for at least the last 15 years or so all London buses have been fitted with a "kneeling device" which lowers the nearside suspension to bring the entrance and exits down to kerb level, I therefore see no need to spend all this public money to raise the pavement/kerb where it's not needed and there isn't a problem!</p>	<p>Will need to be considered by the committee with other, competing views.</p> <p>The "kneeling" suspension still requires a nominal kerb face of 140mm to be fully effective for those with reduce mobility.</p>

		<p>To carry out the alterations to the pavement/kerb at the bus stops current location would be I expect be problematic to the residents at 87, hence your additional proposal to relocate the bus stop.</p> <p>I therefore wish to object to the Proposal to Relocate the bus stop to outside Menthone Place.</p> <p>1/ Should the relocation go ahead then the "Bus stop clearway" where parking is not permitted will prevent the refuse lorry from stopping to empty our euro bin located in bin shed next to the southern boundary as I have now detailed on your drawing and attached to this email. If the refuse collectors did decide to flout the parking restriction then the raising of the pavement/kerb will also prove problematic to the refuse collectors having a higher kerb to negotiate which may well have health &amp; safety implications. Also in raising the pavement, us residents would then lose our step free access from our pathway onto the public pavement that we currently enjoy and the refuse collectors would also have a further step to negotiate with our bin.</p> <p>2/ The residents at 87 where the current bus stop is located moved into that house knowing full well it was there. We Leaseholders bought our flats without a bus stop located outside our frontage and may well have chosen not to, had it already been in place. I feel sure the Freeholder of Menthone Place would also be of the same opinion. I fully expect relocating the bus stop to outside Menthone Place will have a detrimental effect on our</p>	
--	--	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--

		<p>property prices as well.</p> <p>3/ We currently experience and especially at weekends, a litter problem where passing pedestrians throw there litter onto our garden area. If the bus stop is relocated then the litter problem will become worse with people waiting at the stop rather than just walking past.</p> <p>In conclusion it would appear the council is wishing to create numerous problems to its residents and council tax payers where none existed. The stress and anxiety that your proposals have personally caused me through this nonsensical proposal are most certainly something I could well have done without.</p>	
<p>Jane Elliot-Waine 82a North Street</p>		<p>We live at 82a North Street and are somewhat dismayed at the proposal to relocate the bus stop opposite our property. The current bus stop location, drawing reference QM016-OF212A works perfectly, not overly disturbing residents or interfering with our privacy from people from the top decks of the buses being able to stare into our property. It is situated next to commercial properties therefore not disturbing anyone and of a night the cafe there is closed so has no affect on them at all.</p> <p>The proposal to move it in option 2-A seems ludicrous and we would like to formally notify you that we are completely against the proposal for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- This would seriously compromise the privacy of not just our property but that of 11 others residents in the road.</li> </ul>	



		<p>The current position only affects 2 people, so how can this be a good move. We certainly don't relish the idea of up to 80 people being able to stare into our property, especially my bedroom, as by personal choice we don't have net curtains, our home though feels private and that's the way we'd like it to continue.</p> <p>- The pavement is not particularly wide outside Menthone Place and the provision of a bus stop would make passing and alighting for the buses, especially for the disabled far more difficult. Current position is wider as next to commercial property with large frontage making passing and alighting from the buses much easier for the disabled and people with young children.</p> <p>- Moving the bus stop would also increase noise and disturbance to us at all hours of the day or night. The noise of the engines running when waiting, cars trying to pass revving, kids shouting particular at night, we get all this already but at least it is not right opposite us at present. Also following the introduction of traffic lights at the end of north street, queues of traffic particularly of a weekend run all the way passed Burnway, with buses sitting opposite again this will cause greater disturbance and also make getting off of our driveway more difficult and more dangerous.</p> <p>- I feel there is potential safety issue as well for residents of Menthone Place trying to exit from their car park. With buses parked in such close proximity to the exit this will create a blind spot for drivers trying to exit and for drivers</p>	
--	--	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--

		<p>overtaking the parked buses, the potential for accidents will increase because of this.</p> <p>Because of the reasons outlined above we ask that the council take a common sense approach to this and leave the bus stop where it is.</p>	
<p>Mrs J Millard 81 Ardleigh Green Road</p>	<p>QM016-OF-205A Outside 75 to 83</p>	<p>Objects to scheme.</p>	<p>Alternative layout being consulted on and will be the subject of a separate report to HAC in early 2014.</p>
<p>Kellie Crane 83 Ardleigh Green Road</p>	<p>QM016-OF-205A Outside 75 to 83</p>	<p>Objects to scheme.</p>	